

Borough of Carlisle
Historical and Architectural Review Board
Meeting Minutes – January 3, 2023

Members present: Jay Abom, Ed Hazel, Justin Hovetter, Tom Easterly

Staff Members present: Jared Woolston

Meeting was called to order at 5:30 p.m.

Consent Agenda:

1. The Board, upon motion by J. Abom and second by E. Hazel, unanimously approved the minutes of the November 28, 2022, HARB meeting.

Regular Agenda:

1. A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness by Shumberger Real Estate Group, LLC of 21-23 N. Hanover Street to replace front façade windows and doors, and changes to the first-floor store façade including lighting and surface materials. A sign will be submitted under separate application.

There was some discussion regarding the proposed windows on the second and third floors being one over one (pane) windows. J. Abom requested information about the original windows for the building. Historical pictures provided by the applicant during the meeting show large eight over one windows and smaller four over one windows. The Board asked the applicant to consider installing windows that reflect the window orientation in the historic photo. The applicant stated that all the historic windows were replaced with single pane windows and that single windows would be preferred from a cost standpoint. *The Board, upon motion by T. Easterly, second by J. Abom, recommended approval of the request as submitted.*

J. Woolston addressed the Board to advise them that the current google streeview photo of the property was observed during the Board's discussion and all of the 2nd and 3rd floor windows except one window that was replaced with plywood had divided panes. J. Woolston advised that the state of the building represented disinvestment in the downtown which may warrant some latitude for the proposed renovation project. However, the HARB guidelines require consideration for the removal of the existing 2nd and 3rd floor windows which are important architectural features of the building. Staff advised the applicant to return to the Board and clarify the proposal. The applicant indicated that the storm windows obscured the divided panes from view and that the application was inadvertently wrong with regard to statements that only single pane windows exist on the 2nd and 3rd floors. *The Board, upon motion by J. Hovetter, and seconded by J. Abom, reopened the case.*

J. Hovetter explained to the applicant that the Board must make decisions that are defensible through the lenses of future applicants and if someone comes to the Board and says “well, you let them take out historic elements, then you have to let me do the same.”

The Board asked the applicant to revise the application to propose in-kind divided pane windows in the 2nd and 3rd floors as shown in the historical pictures provided by the applicant. The applicant agreed.

Consensus: The Board, upon motion by E. Hazel and second by J. Abom, approved the façade renovation plan as submitted for the first floor and as amended during review with divided pane windows on the second and third floors as shown in the historical pictures provided by the applicant.

2. A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness by Ryan Goodling of 157 S. Hanover Street to replace existing double doors with same size and location. Existing doors have divided pane windows. Application indicates drawings and/or architectural renderings provided, but information limited to written specifications with limited information. Glass is indicated, but not to the extent or design.

The Board clarified that the materials used will be in-kind.

Consensus: The Board, upon motion by J. Abom and second by J. Hovetter unanimously recommended approval of this request.

3. A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness by Robert Wrightstone of 304 S. Hanover Street to Replace 3 existing double hung windows (side/back of building) with new windows of the same size and location. Material is indicated as, “primed white profile molding, soft lite pro series.” Replacement of trim at back porch (material not specified) and replacement of porch ceiling with vinyl materials. Work area visible from Walnut Street.

The applicant for the project did not attend the meeting. J. Hovetter indicated the rear and side of the building would be affected by the proposal and the guidelines allow for vinyl but the applicant should make a case for using vinyl windows on the side of the building. Staff advised that a letter was sent to the applicant advising meeting attendance and the application may be tabled due to lack of information.

Consensus: The Board, upon motion by J. Hovetter and second by T. Easterly, unanimously recommended tabling this application due to the lack of information.

There being no further business, the Board adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,
Jared Woolston